The opinions expressed in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Organization for Migration (IOM) or the IOM Member States. The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout the report do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of IOM concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries.

IOM is committed to the principle that humane and orderly migration benefits migrants and society. As an intergovernmental organization, IOM acts with its partners in the international community to: assist in meeting the operational challenges of migration; advance understanding of migration issues; encourage social and economic development through migration; and uphold the human dignity and well-being of migrants.

While efforts have been taken to verify the accuracy of this information, neither The Economist Intelligence Unit Ltd. nor its affiliates can accept any responsibility or liability for reliance by any person on this information.
Acknowledgments

São Paulo City Hall
Municipal Department of Human Rights and Citizenship (SMDHC)

Bruno Covas
Mayor

Berenice Maria Giannella
Municipal Secretary of Human Rights and Citizenship

Marisa Fortunato
Assistant Secretary

Luiz Orsatti Filho
Chief of Staff

Jennifer Alvarez
Coordinator of Policies for Immigrants and Promotion of Decent Labor

Ana León
Luciana Elena Vázquez
Marina Luna
Vinicius Duque
Advisers

Abril Romero
Bryan Sempertegui Rodas
Isabella Hay Ide
Interns

International Organization for Migration

Stéphane Rostiaux
IOM Chief of Mission in Brazil

Annalisa Pellegrino
David Martineau
Guilherme Otero
Isadora Steffens
Marcelo Torelly
Radka Chobotova
Sílvia Sassa Roy
Tâli Almeida
Andrea Milan
Reshma Cunnoosamy
Roberta Aita
Susanne Melde
IOM

Support
The Economist Intelligence Unit
Conselho Municipal de Imigrantes (CMI-SP)
Escola Nacional de Administração Pública (ENAP)
Secretaria Municipal de Assistência e Desenvolvimento Social (SMADS-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Cultura (SMC-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Trabalho (SMDET-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Educação (SME-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Habitação (SEHAB-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Relações Internacionais (SMRI-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Saúde (SMS-SP)
Secretaria Municipal de Segurança Urbana (SMSU-SP)
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

- OBJECTIVES // 7
- INTRODUCTION // 8
- LOCAL CONTEXT // 11
- KEY FINDINGS // 14
- KEY SOURCES // 28
- ANNEX // 33
OBJECTIVES

1. Help local authorities take stock of the migration initiatives they have in place.

2. Foster dialogue on migration between national governments and local authorities.

3. Enable local authorities to learn from one another by sharing common challenges and identify potential solutions.

“Rapid urbanization continues to transform the demographic landscape of many countries around the world. Cities are already home to the majority of international migrants, driven by opportunity as well as necessity, and local authorities are becoming leaders in finding creative solutions for rapid social change, supporting communities through innovation.”

1 António Vitorino, IOM Director General, report to the 109th session of the IOM Council (November 2018). Available at www.iom.int/speeches-and-talks/director-generals-report-109th-session-council.
INTRODUCTION
The Migration Governance Indicators

In 2015, the International Organization for Migration (IOM), in collaboration with the Economist Intelligence Unit, developed the Migration Governance Indicators (MGI), a set of 90 indicators that help States assess the comprehensiveness of their migration governance structures. The indicators constitute a starting point to engage governments in a consultative process that allows them to identify areas that are well developed and others that would benefit from further development, and most importantly priorities that are in line with the specific challenges and opportunities a given country is facing.

The MGI is characterized by three fundamental attributes:

1. **The MGI is a voluntary exercise**: It is conducted in countries that have requested to be part of the process.

2. **The MGI is sensitive to national specificities**: It recognizes the different challenges and opportunities of each context and, therefore, does not propose a one-size-fits-all solution but rather sparks a discussion on what well-governed migration can mean.

3. **The MGI is a process**: It is not a static tool to collect data on countries' migration frameworks. It is rather the first step of a dynamic process that can enable governments identify areas of their migration policy in need of further development, or that could benefit from capacity-building.

Migration Governance Indicators: From national to local

The role of cities and municipalities in migration governance\(^2\) has grown significantly in recent decades, given the rapid pace of urbanization and the importance of cities as destinations for all forms of migration and displacement. Researchers, policymakers and international development agencies have all highlighted the crucial role of cities and municipalities in both accommodating migrants and formulating sustainable responses to migration-related matters.

With this in mind, in 2016, the United Nations Member States adopted the New Urban Agenda (NUA) at the Habitat III Conference in Quito (Ecuador). This was the first time that a United Nations framework fully integrated migration into the strategic planning and management of cities and urban systems. Its adoption was a significant recognition of the role of local governments not only in the management of migration at the local level but also in realizing the urban dimensions of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, including, but not limited to, Sustainable Development Goal 11, which has been designed to make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable.

In an effort to support the discussion between different levels of governments on migration governance, IOM has adapted the MGI to the local level (the Local MGI).\(^3\) The Local MGI seeks to offer a more comprehensive picture of a country’s migration governance landscape by juxtaposing a local dimension to MGI national assessments. Like its national equivalent, the Local MGI is based on a set of 87 indicators helping local authorities take stock of local migration strategies or initiatives in place and identify good practices as well as areas with potential for further development. The aim of the exercise is to foster dialogue on migration between national governments and local authorities and enable local authorities to learn from one another by discussing common challenges and identifying potential solutions.

---

2 Migration governance refers to the system of institutions, legal frameworks, mechanisms and practices aimed at regulating migration and protecting migrants. It used almost synonymously with the term “migration management”, although migration management is also sometimes used to refer to the narrow act of regulating cross-border movement at the State level.

3 Funding is provided by the Government of Sweden. For more information, please refer to [https://migrationdataportal.org/local-mgi](https://migrationdataportal.org/local-mgi).
While the Local MGI retains the attributes of the National MGI, it is also anchored in the notion that cities have different capacities, competencies and added value when it comes to governing migration. Therefore, the methodology has been adapted to reflect that the degree of fiscal and political autonomy of participating cities influences the kind of migration governance they can practically and legally engage in. Furthermore, new indicators on the level of autonomy and capacities have been added to give some context to the results of the assessment.

Given the differences between the MGI at the national and local levels, the purpose of the Local MGI is not to provide a baseline but rather to be a tool for government authorities to have an introspective look at the measures they have in place to manage migration, as well as to share their experiences. Furthermore, it recognizes that good practices can take different forms depending on the division of competencies between local and national authorities. Therefore, the Local MGI analysis should not be interpreted as a recommendation to change the division of competencies but rather be understood as a tool to generate discussion on what cities can do on migration within the scope of their mandate.

The Local MGI was rolled out in three cities: Accra, Montréal and São Paulo. The participation of these three cities in the pilot phase of this exercise will allow IOM to refine the Local MGI framework with the idea of rolling it out in a larger number of cities.

This document is the result of the Local MGI in São Paulo; its production was possible due to the support of the Office of Coordination of Policies for Immigrants and Promotion of Decent Work of the Secretariat of Human Rights and Citizenship of the municipality of São Paulo. The report summarizes the well-developed areas of the municipality of São Paulo’s migration governance structures, as well as the areas with a potential for further development, as assessed by the Local MGI.⁴

---

⁴ The municipality of São Paulo and the State of São Paulo are two independent federal entities with separate administrative tasks, budgets and policies. City of São Paulo refers to the municipality of São Paulo.
**Migration trends**
The total number of international immigrants registered in the municipality of São Paulo, according to the National System of Registration of Foreigners (Sistema Nacional de Cadastramento de Registro de Estrangeiros, SINCRE), as of June 2019, was 361,201, approximately 3 per cent of the city’s total population.

São Paulo has been a destination city particularly for immigrants coming from Portugal, Italy, Spain and Germany since the nineteenth century, and Japan, China and Angola since the twentieth century. Migration from Latin American countries, such as Peru and the Plurinational State of Bolivia, as well as migration from Haiti and different African countries, is a more recent phenomenon. Today’s migration to São Paulo is very diversified.

**Figure 1:** Numbers of migrants registered in São Paulo by country of origin, June 2019

![Diagram showing numbers of migrants by country of origin, June 2019](image)


---

5 More information is available at [www.saopaulo.sp.gov.br/conhecasp/nossa-gente/migrantes/](http://www.saopaulo.sp.gov.br/conhecasp/nossa-gente/migrantes/).

### Competencies of the city

| Level of decentralization of local authorities in Brazil | Brazil is a federal republic, where the federal, State and municipal governments have distinct responsibilities, are independent and are not hierarchically coordinated. The municipalities in Brazil are responsible for provision of certain basic public services for all residents. These services include basic health care, primary education, infrastructure and transportation. Municipalities can also provide their own social safety nets and welfare, such as shelters and food banks. |
| Competencies in relation to migration | The municipalities in Brazil are responsible for the provision of certain basic public services for all the residents, including immigrants, and the legislation of the municipality of São Paulo also foresees as municipal competency the inclusion of migrants into the community. In terms of international migration policies (e.g. visas), the municipality is not a decision-making government body, as this is the responsibility of the federal government. The Migration Law (No. 13.445/2017) foresees increased cooperation between federative entities (city, State and federal governments) in the development of the national migration policy. |
| Local financing mechanisms and the restrictions on their use | Municipalities in Brazil finance their activities and actions from collection of local taxes (mainly property taxes, transfers of property taxes and services taxes). They also receive a portion of taxes collected by State and federal governments, mainly used for expenses related to education and health. Use of revenue is not restricted except for specific taxes. In addition, municipalities receive funds from traffic fines, licence fees and penalties imposed on the collection of debt, among others. |
| Local participation in the formulation of migration policy | Municipalities in Brazil may be consulted in the development of the national policy, upon request from the federal government. For example, the federal government consulted the municipality of São Paulo during the large influx of immigrants and refugees from Haiti and the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela. Another example is the first National Conference on Migration and Refuge (Conferência Nacional sobre Migrações e Refúgio, COMIGRAR), held in 2014, for which the preparatory conferences took place at the local level, organized by civil society and the public sector, as well as at the State level. Some local delegates also participated at the national level. Article 120 of the new Migration Law (No. 13.445/2017) rules that cities, States, civil society organizations, the private sector and international organizations should be included in the development of the national migration policy, but this legal rule still lacks executive regulation to be effective. |

---

7 This is in accordance with Guideline VII of Municipal Law 16.478/2016, which states: “establish partnerships with agencies and/or entities from other federative spheres to promote the inclusion of immigrants and expedite the issue of documents”.
9 Migration Law (No. 13.445/2017), Article 120 states: “The National Policy on Migration, Refuge and Statelessness have the purpose of coordinating and articulating sectoral actions implemented by the Federal Executive in cooperation with the States, the Federal District and the Municipalities, with the participation of civil society organizations, international organizations and private entities, according to the regulation.”
KEY FINDINGS
The Local MGI is composed of around 87 indicators grouped under the 6 different dimensions of migration governance that draw upon the MiGOF categories:

- **Migrants’ Rights**
  - Indicators in this category look at the extent to which migrants have access to certain social services such as health, education and social security. They also examine measures to ensure integration and access to work.

- **Whole-of-Government Approach**
  - Indicators in this category assess the institutional frameworks of cities for migration. This area also examines the existence of migration strategies consistent with development objectives, as well as institutional transparency and coherence in migration management.

- **Partnerships**
  - Indicators in this category focus on cities’ efforts to cooperate on migration issues with the national government as well as other cities and relevant non-governmental actors, including civil society organizations and the private sector.

- **Welfare of Migrants**
  - Indicators in this category assess cities’ initiatives in terms of international student mobility, access to the labour market and decent working conditions for migrant workers. Aspects related to diaspora engagement and migrant remittances are also included in this domain.

- **Mobility Dimension of Crises**
  - Indicators in this category examine the type and level of readiness of cities to deal with aspects of mobility crises. The questions focus on the processes in place for citizens and non-citizens both during and after disasters, especially if humanitarian assistance is available for migrants and citizens.

- **Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration**
  - Indicators in this category look at the cities’ approaches to migrant safety as well as return and reintegration policies and the fight against trafficking in persons.
1.1. Migration governance: Examples of well-developed areas

The municipality of São Paulo has a long-standing tradition of providing services for migrants, yet with the creation of the Coordinating Unit of Policies for Immigrants and Promotion of Decent Work (Coordenação de Políticas para Imigrantes e Promoção do Trabalho Decente, CPMigTD) (hereinafter the Coordinating Unit) and of the Municipal Policy for the Immigrant Population (Política Municipal para a População Imigrante de São Paulo, PMPI), there was an opportunity for a broader recognition by the municipal government of its responsibility regarding issues related to the immigrant population in the municipality. The PMPI adopts a rights-based approach to migration, regardless of immigrants’ migratory status or documentation, and aims to implement interdepartmental and intersectoral work under the coordination of the Coordinating Unit, which is part of the Municipal Department of Human Rights and Citizenship (Secretaria Municipal de Direitos Humanos e Cidadania, SMDHC).

In the municipality of São Paulo, local migratory governance is based on the definition of immigrant population outlined in the PMPI: “all persons who move from their usual place of residence in another country to Brazil, including labour immigrants, students, refugees, stateless persons, as well as their families, irrespective of their migratory status and documentation”.

Education

In general, there are no limitations on access to education for residents in Brazil, regardless of whether they have documents or not. According to the Municipal Department of Education (Secretaria Municipal de Educação, SME), in March 2018 there were approximately 5,300 children with different nationalities registered in the municipal network, and the number continues to grow. The SME has introduced various pedagogical practices in basic education to include interculturality aspects. As a result, several initiatives were implemented to combat prejudice, xenophobia and bullying.

The SMDHC, in partnership with the SME, created a specialized Portuguese course for immigrants, through a programme called Open Doors: Portuguese for Immigrants, which was incorporated into the municipal education system, allowing the dissemination of the course information in the city. The initiative benefited 438 participants in 2017, a number that increased almost threefold to 1,206 in 2018. The programme has an intercultural perspective and is offered in three levels: basic, intermediate and advanced. It is the first course of this nature in Brazil, offered within the municipal education network and financed through the public budget.

The SME also launched the programme December Immigrant in São Paulo’s municipal schools in 2014, 2016 and 2017. The aim of the programme is to promote discussions on migration, to stimulate social integration and to combat xenophobia and discrimination. During this one-month event, teachers were encouraged to include themes related to immigrants into the class material. For example, in Portuguese and/or literature classes, works from countries of origin were presented; in social studies and/or history classes, facts and issues related to migration were addressed. In addition, municipal schools offered lectures and workshops with special guests, including immigrants, civil society organizations (CSOs) and academics. Starting this year, there will be a new programme, called June Immigrant, which intends to initiate discussions and exchanges among teachers about their experiences and pedagogical practices with children with different cultural background and nationalities.

---

12 The Policy is in accordance with Law No. 16.478/2016 and Decree No. 57.533/2016.
Health-care services are free and can be accessed by everyone in Brazil through the Unified Health System (Sistema Único de Saúde, SUS), which is the Brazilian national health-care system. The municipality of São Paulo finances and administers hospitals, clinics and Basic Health Units (Unidade Básica de Saúde, UBS) that provide basic health services in the city. Each UBS consists of multidisciplinary teams with the presence of community health agents selected within the community served.\(^\text{13}\) According to the Municipal Department of Health (Secretaria Municipal de Saúde, SMS) in the municipality of São Paulo, there are currently eight community health agents who are immigrants, who facilitate contact and communication with immigrant families and help to better identify their needs and provide information on health services. In addition, some of the information on the health-care services was translated into several languages and is publicly available on the website as well as distributed in the UBS. The SMS has also developed several informational, educational and institutional materials on health specifically prepared for the immigrant population in seven different languages.\(^\text{14}\)

The service performed by the UBS can be accessed through the registration and issuance of the SUS card. It is available to everyone regardless of the migratory status and possession of documents; thus, it is accessible also for immigrants. Access to health care cannot be denied due to the lack of documentation and/or the SUS card. The information collected by the SUS includes the name, date of birth and nationality of the immigrant, and the region where the care service is provided. The data collected can provide a better picture about public health issues of immigrant population. According to the Epidemiology and Information Coordinating Section of the Municipal Health Department of São Paulo (Coordenação de Epidemiologia e Informação, CEInfo),\(^\text{15}\) it is possible to identify the family nuclei of the immigrant population and to draw an epidemiological profile by territory and nationality.\(^\text{16}\) In 2015, CEInfo published a comprehensive study on the sociodemographic profile and health aspects of immigrants living in the municipality of São Paulo, including information on immigrant access to the public health system.

Migration has been consistently included as a cross-cutting theme in the municipality’s Municipal Health Plans. The Pluriannual Plans for 2010–2013, 2014–2017 and 2018–2021 include guidelines, general and specific goals, and strategic targets related to the immigrant population. In 2015, the Municipal Health Council of São Paulo approved a policy proposal for immigrants and created a working group on migrant and refugee health that is composed of technical experts, public administrators and representatives from the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO/WHO). The group met periodically and organized a monthly forum with the participation of CSOs, immigrant associations and academics, along with the Coordinating Unit. The working group was responsible for implementing several activities related to the health sector, among which was the creation of a project on permanent education on health whose goals, among others, were to sensitize health professionals on migration issues and organize 200 discussion events on migration issues in 63 health facilities with immigrants working as cultural mediators.

The SMS works with the Coordinating Unit, linked to the SMDHC, and with the Municipal Department of Assistance and Social Development (Secretaria Municipal de Assistência e Desenvolvimento Social, SMADS) to facilitate access to health services for immigrants. As a result, for example, the team or members of the local health unit can schedule a visit to migrant shelters and organize information sessions about health services.

Immigrants’ Reference and Assistance Centre

In 2014, the Coordinating Unit created the Immigrants’ Reference and Assistance Centre (Centro de Referência e Atendimento para Imigrantes, CRAI), which aims to promote access to rights and social, cultural and economic integration of the immigrant population in the municipality. The CRAI is a public service managed through a partnership with the religious civil society organization Franciscan Solidarity Service (Serviço Franciscano de Solidariedade, SEFRAS). Through multilingual immigrant attendants, the CRAI facilitates access to public services such as health, education and


\(\text{14}\) These materials can be found at [www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/cidade/secretarias/saude/publicacoes/index.php?p=19273#imigrantes](http://www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/cidade/secretarias/saude/publicacoes/index.php?p=19273#imigrantes).


\(\text{16}\) It should be noted that the registration of nationality is recent; therefore, the Unified Health System (Sistema Único de Saúde, SUS) data does not necessarily match the reality of health information on the immigrant population in São Paulo. In the case of children born in Brazil (therefore entitled to Brazilian nationality), it is possible to register in the SUS the nationalities of mothers who gave birth and from then the Municipal Health Department of São Paulo (Coordenação de Epidemiologia e Informação, CEInfo) can identify immigrant or refugee families.
social assistance, as well as information and guidance on the process of migratory status regularization, access to public social services and the labour market, as well as legal and psychosocial assistance, all provided in up to nine different languages. The CRAI employees also conduct training for public servants and organize events with various bodies of the municipal departments. The legal assistance is offered for free through a partnership with the Public Defender’s Office (Defensoria Pública da União, DPU). Psychosocial assistance is provided through a partnership with the staff of the Veredas Project, linked to the University of São Paulo.

The Coordinating Unit developed a guide for immigrants and public servants, with information on rights, available public services and other useful information about the municipality of São Paulo. The guide We Are All Migrants is available in digital\textsuperscript{17} and print versions and distributed through the SMDHC and the CRAI. The guide exists in seven language variations, namely Arabic, Creole, English, French, Mandarin, Portuguese and Spanish, and covers a wide range of topics including information about the migratory regularization procedure; access to legal assistance; health services; education; social welfare; housing; labour; access to banking; rights of adolescent and children immigrants; women’s rights; lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) rights; culture; and public transportation.

Political participation
Regarding political participation, Article 14 of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Brazil of 1988 prohibits non-nationals to vote in municipal, State or federal elections in Brazil. The only exception is for Portuguese nationals with a residence period longer than three years in Brazil.\textsuperscript{18} Nevertheless, in the municipality of São Paulo, immigrants, regardless of their migratory status or documentation, can vote for and be elected as members of the Municipal Council of Immigrants (Conselho Municipal de Imigrantes, CMI), as well as for the extraordinary seats of the Participative Councils, according to Municipal Law No. 16.478/2016. Despite the limitations that exceed municipal competencies, the municipality of São Paulo has created spaces for social participation that allow immigrants to exercise their citizenship.

Cultural diversity
Promotion of cultural festivals is a strategy to foster cultural diversity, encourage immigrants’ access to the public space, bring Brazilians closer to immigrant communities and stimulate intercultural dialogue. For example, the Coordinating Unit works closely with the Peruvian community and the Consulate of Peru in São Paulo to promote the traditional Andean festival Yunza. Another example is the annual support for the largest Latin American party in São Paulo, Alasitas, a traditional Bolivian party that has been included in the official calendar of events of the municipality of São Paulo since 2015.

The Municipal Department of Culture has promoted an immigrant stage at the traditional São Paulo’s annual event Virada Cultural, in 2017, as well as the inclusion of immigrants in cultural public notices, such as the programme Valorization of Cultural Initiatives.

1.2. Areas with potential for further development
The municipality of São Paulo could develop information strategies and promote active mechanisms to inform immigrants on how to access public services in diverse government bodies, complementing the CRAI’s informative work. More information for people who wish to emigrate could also be made easily available.

There is also space to enhance the technical capacity of public agents, particularly those working directly with immigrants. These efforts should also include the improvement of public agents’ language skills in order to facilitate access to offered services, especially in areas with higher concentration of immigrants.

\textsuperscript{17} The guide is available at \url{https://issuu.com/smdhc/docs/guaimigrantes_ingles}.

\textsuperscript{18} This is according to Article 17 of Decree No. 3.927/2001, which promulgates the Treaty of Amity, Cooperation and Consultation between Brazil and Portugal: “The enjoyment of political rights by Brazilians in Portugal and by Portuguese in Brazil will only be granted to those who have enjoyed three years of habitual residence and depends on request to the competent authority.”
2.1. Migration governance: Examples of well-developed areas

Based on the regulations that determine the structure of the SMDHC, the Coordinating Unit is responsible for the implementation of policies for immigrants at the local level and, together with the CMI, coordinates local migration governance. The Coordinating Unit works with other municipal departments and civil society organizations in providing services to immigrants.

In December 2013, the municipality of São Paulo held the First Municipal Conference on Policies for Immigrants through the participatory Municipal Organizing Committee, which was composed by government and civil society representatives and led by the Coordinating Unit. It was jointly organized with 13 other municipal departments and 14 civil society organizations, with the participation of 695 people. The Conference had an advisory nature and aimed at providing proposals to support the development of public policies for immigrant populations. As a result, 57 final proposals developed jointly in working groups were approved during the plenary session. During the Conference, 50 civil society participants (including minimum established rates of 50% women and 50% immigrant delegates) were elected as delegates for the National Conference on Migration and Refuge.

The 2016 PMPI\textsuperscript{19} was created by an intersectoral committee composed of 26 members, 13 of whom were from the municipal public administration and the other 13 from civil society. It is a transversal and intersectoral policy focused on the immigrant population of the municipality of São Paulo and affects the entire local government structure. The PMPI document is available in English, French, Portuguese and Spanish.

The PMPI established the CMI, linked to the SMDHC, which is composed of 16 members, including eight members from civil society elected by immigrants and eight members appointed by the government.\textsuperscript{20} The CMI is responsible for the formulation, monitoring and evaluation of migration policy in the municipality of São Paulo, together with the Coordinating Unit.

The municipality of São Paulo has regional offices, called subprefectures (\textit{subprefeituras}), that facilitate the provision of government services in the municipality. The subprefectures have Municipal Participatory Councils, composed of elected members from civil society. Since 2015, these councils have reserved places for the representation of immigrants, depending on the proportion of the population in the area of each subprefecture. Immigrants can vote for immigrant members as well as run for the election for the designated seats. In addition, according to Municipal Law No. 15.946, every municipal council must be composed of at least 50 per cent women.

The Coordinating Unit conducts training for municipal public servants. These training courses aim at raising awareness of the specific needs of the immigrant population and inform about immigrants’ rights. Training sessions were conducted for employees from areas related to health, welfare, education and civil guard officials. A total number of 1,071 public servants were trained in 2014 and 2015. Since 2017, the Coordinating Unit has been offering the course “We Are All Migrants: Migration and Rights in the Municipality of São Paulo”, monthly at the Municipal School of Administration of São Paulo (Escola Municipal de Administração Pública, EMASP); it targets the municipal public servants and interested city residents, especially those who work directly with immigrant populations.

\textsuperscript{19} The Municipal Policy for the Immigrant Population (Política Municipal para a População Imigrante de São Paulo, PMPI) was formulated in accordance with Municipal Law No. 16.478/2016.

\textsuperscript{20} Among those in civil society, membership is divided between three groups: a) collectives, associations and immigrant organizations; b) collectives, associations and organizations that support immigrants; and c) immigrants. The eight members from civil society were elected by the immigrant population in August 2018 to serve their term until July 2020.
Regarding data collection on immigrant populations, the municipal departments that maintain population registers rely on different information systems. The Coordinating Unit annually requests editable data from various departments in order to monitor immigrants’ access to municipal public services and support the formulation of local public policies. In addition, the Coordinating Unit carries out yearly an online collaborative mapping of organizations and collectives working on migration issues, Portuguese courses for immigrants and immigrant communities’ cultural fairs.

2.2. Areas with potential for further development

The PMPI legally establishes local migratory governance as a State policy rather than a government policy and outlines the principles, guidelines and objectives for the municipal public power of São Paulo. Nevertheless, it does not define a programme or plan for the implementation or monitoring of those objectives.

The municipality of São Paulo and its departments collect data on immigrants benefitting from public services provided by the municipal government, such as access to employment, health, education and shelter programmes, yet variables related to migration (such as nationality) are not always available. Data and knowledge about the immigrant population can be improved by cross-referencing the data collected by the various departments and analysing them together with the information in databases at the federal level.

Local governments, including the municipality of São Paulo, participate in certain decision-making on the processes of relocation and reception of immigrants. For example, in 2018, they coordinated efforts with the federal government within the national relocation strategy of Venezuelan nationals from northern border States to other regions in Brazil. Although this involvement is not yet formalized in a written agreement, the municipality of São Paulo initially received 300 relocated beneficiaries in the municipal reception network and organized a city-level working group to discuss procedures for reception, welcoming and local integration with the participation of civil society. The relocation strategy is also supported by IOM and other United Nations agencies.

There is space to expand the information and public knowledge available about conferences and municipal councils so that immigrants can present their demands to participate in the consultative processes already in place in the municipality.

Considering that the City Urban Planning is a tool to meet the demands of the entire population, including immigrants as one of its axes can contribute to the construction of a more inclusive city.

---

21 The Municipal Department of Economic Development and Labour (Secretaria Municipal de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Trabalho, SMDET) has data on the number of immigrants who have sought employment services by country of origin. The Municipal Department of Education has data on the number of immigrant children and adolescents enrolled in the municipal school network as well as the number of students enrolled in the programme Portas Abertas (Open Doors), which is offered in Portuguese. The Municipal Department of Assistance and Social Development collects data on the immigrants assisted at its shelters. The Municipal Department of Health has an observatory that publishes data regarding the access of the immigrant population to its services. Most of this data is not published.
3.1. Migration governance: Examples of well-developed areas

The PMPI is structured intersectorally and works closely with civil society organizations to address the needs of the immigrant population. One example is SEFRAS, a religious civil society organization that works closely with the municipality of São Paulo to provide shelter to vulnerable immigrants and refugees. SEFRAS also manages the CRAI in partnership with the SMDHC of the São Paulo City Hall.

Local authorities also established partnerships with academia to produce knowledge about the municipality’s immigrant population and guide policy. In 2013, the Coordinating Unit signed an agreement with the Institute of International Relations of the University of São Paulo to develop the Cosmopolis project. The project had two main goals: to create a portal to gather and archive studies related to migration, especially those related to the municipality of São Paulo; and to develop a profile of immigrants’ access to public services in São Paulo. The results of this study were published in 2017 in the e-book Immigrants in São Paulo: Diagnosis of Assistance to the Immigrant Population in the Municipality and Profile of Immigrant Public Service Users.22

At the national level, in April 2017, São Paulo participated in the Fourth Meeting of Municipalities for Sustainable Development, of the National Front of Mayors (a Brazilian association of active city mayors), in which the PMPI was presented.

The municipality of São Paulo cooperates on migration issues with IOM and other United Nations agencies, such as the International Labour Organization (ILO) and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), to develop good practices in migration-related policies. In addition, the Municipal Secretariat of Education works in cooperation with the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) to provide materials and training to teachers of the municipal education network.

The municipality’s Department of International Relations and the SMDHC have been engaged in strengthening discussions on migration in multilateral forums. São Paulo has recently joined the Mayors Migration Council, an international network that seeks to facilitate cities’ engagement and influence in international deliberations on migration and refuge. Representatives from São Paulo took part in discussions related to the New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants. In 2018, São Paulo participated in the Solidarity Cities Meeting and in the intergovernmental conference of the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration in Marrakesh (Morocco). During this occasion, the city also participated in the Fifth Mayoral Forum on Human Mobility, Migration and Development.

The municipality of São Paulo is engaged in Urban20, an initiative that seeks to collect inputs from major cities and urban centres to make recommendations to national leaders at the Group of 20 Summit. In this initiative, representatives from São Paulo actively promote discussions on migration issues. São Paulo is also a member of three other international networks that include discussions on migration issues, although not exclusively, namely the Mercosur network, the Metropolis global network of major cities and metropolitan areas, and the United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) where migration is one of the seven priorities for local governance.

3.2. Areas with potential for further development

The municipality of São Paulo is not part of any formal bilateral city-to-city cooperation initiative on issues related to migration neither at the national level nor the international level. In addition, national networks of cities dedicated to exchange best practices on migratory governance at the local level could be promoted and strengthened.

4.1. Migration governance: Examples of well-developed areas

In the municipality of São Paulo, there are several programmes designed to support immigrants’ entrepreneurship activities. In 2018, the São Paulo Development Agency (Agência São Paulo de Desenvolvimento, ADESAMPA), an autonomous agency related to the Municipal Department of Economic Development and Labour (Secretaria Municipal de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Trabalho, SMDET), organized an entrepreneurship course for immigrants in order to enhance the participants’ capacities to develop entrepreneurship ideas and to create their own businesses. Titled “Build your successful business in São Paulo”, the course was attended by 20 students from diverse countries, such as Angola, Chile, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Pakistan and the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela. The course is likely to be repeated in 2019 due to the positive feedback and the demand.

The National Employment System (Sistema Nacional de Emprego, SINE) is a network present throughout the national territory promoting access to employment, unemployment insurance and professional qualification. Although the budget and guidelines are national, this policy is implemented locally through the Support Centers for Labour and Entrepreneurship (Centros de Apoio ao Trabalho e Empreendedorismo, CATEs). This policy does not specifically target immigrants, yet there is a considerable number of immigrants who use the services of the CATE. From 2012 to March 2019, 13,333 immigrant workers were assisted in the CATE, of whom 4,783 were referred to job opportunities and 516 migrants were employed through this intermediation. Additionally, a 2015 decree allowed the CATE to temporarily issue work permits for immigrants, resulting in 4,085 permits issued that year.

There are various programmes to promote and facilitate access to the labour market available to the entire population, including immigrants. The intersectoral programme, called Bolsa Trabalho – Juventude, Trabalho e Fabricação Digital (Work Stipend – Youth, Work and Digital Manufacturing), promotes the access of unemployed youth (from 16 to 20 years old) from low-income families to training and further qualification through traineeships in the public or private sector. In addition, the programme Operação Trabalho (Operation Work) offers free training to unemployed workers from low-income families. Another programme, Tem Saída (Having an Exit), was launched in 2018; it aims to facilitate access to employment among female victims of domestic violence. Although Tem Saída does not specifically target immigrants, currently there are six immigrant women enrolled in the programme. All these measures are accessible to immigrants, although they are not specifically directed at this group.

Between 2 and 4 April 2019, the event called “First Week of Work and Income for Migrants”, jointly implemented by the SMDHC and the SMDE, was held in the CRAI. The main goal of the event was to offer free services and guidance to immigrants who would like to access the labour market. The initiative assisted about 450 immigrants.

The Coordinating Unit also promotes the financial inclusion of immigrants in the banking system of Brazil. In 2014, the municipal government made an agreement with the Bank of Brazil to support every immigrant to open an account. The cooperation agreement allowed immigrants not only to open an account (which is essential to access many services in Brazil) but also to obtain credit cards and send remittances abroad. A similar agreement was signed between the SMDHC and Caixa Econômica Federal to further facilitate banking services for immigrants from the Common Market of the South (Mercado Común del Sur, MERCOSUR) member countries. Caixa Econômica Federal has a webpage in Spanish with information for immigrants about the agreement and the immigrants’ rights related to financial services. Both agreements have expired and have not been renewed, as Brazil’s Central Bank since then has issued a more flexible list of documents that banks can accept in order to facilitate immigrants’ access to opening a bank account in Brazil.

---

23 The programme is carried out by the SMDET, the Municipal Department of Innovation and Technology (SMIT) and the Municipal Department of Human Rights and Citizenship (SMDHC).
4.2. Areas with potential for further development

Cooperation initiatives with the Regional Labour Superintendence are being prepared with the goal of promoting access to the issuance and renewal of job permits for the immigrant population.

It is recommended to establish policies to raise awareness among companies in general and human resources departments in particular about facilitating the process of hiring immigrants.

There are no strategies within CATEs to direct immigrants to courses offered by the City Hall, such as the Portuguese course Portas Abertas (Open Doors).

There are no initiatives at the local level to promote gender equality for immigrants in the workforce in the municipality of São Paulo, although there are measures (not specific to immigrants) to promote gender equality in the workforce in general.²⁶

The availability of information provided to immigrants on Brazilian legislation – such as health surveillance rules, use of public space, registration in the City Hall, and labour rights and obligations – could be further expanded.

The municipality could sensitize and train financial sector agents to combat racism and xenophobia in the banking sector.

5.1. Migration governance: Examples of well-developed areas
At the local level, there are no comprehensive and intesectoral formalized emergency response protocols or plans that consider immigrant or the coordination and contingency of the migratory consequences of crisis and disasters. The State of São Paulo established the State Natural Disaster Prevention and Geological Risk Mitigation Programme, which coordinates the State’s efforts to reduce the risk of disasters in forests, coasts and other high-risk areas. There is also the National Risk Management and Disaster Response Plan 2012, which is implemented by the federal government. However, none of the documents mentions the impacts of disasters on human displacement. However, the municipality of São Paulo has a contingency plan based on the national civil defense policy and the Social Assistance System (Sistema Único de Assistência Social, SUAS), allowing for integrated actions in times of crisis. It also has a contingency plan for periods of low temperatures that include attention to the specific needs of immigrants. In this context, the Coordinating Unit is responsible for providing support in the development of materials in several languages for immigrants in the streets or those in specific shelters.

In addition, the Secretariat of Social Assistance and Development (Secretaria Municipal de Assistência e Desenvolvimento Social, SMADS) has four shelters (Centros de Acolhida, CAs) with a focus on the immigrant population, besides shelters dedicated to the general population that can also be accessed by immigrants. These permanent specific shelters were established after the São Paulo City Hall received a large influx of Haitian immigrants in mid-2014. The districts of Bela Vista and Pari have two CAs each that are unique to immigrants and can accommodate men, women and children; the district of Penha has an exclusive CA for immigrant women and children; and the district of Bom Retiro has a preferential CA for immigrant women and children. These CAs are additional to those intended for the general population, but they can also open for immigrants. In 2018, due to adherence to the relocation strategy of Venezuelan immigrants, the municipality of São Paulo temporarily assigned the shelter Centro Temporário de Acolhida (CTA) of the neighborhood of São Mateus to receive only immigrants. Additionally, the PMPI establishes that the CRAI will provide support in emergency situations resulting from the arrival of large groups of immigrants and refugees in vulnerable situations.27

5.2. Areas with potential for further development
There are no explicit local strategies to deal with migratory movements caused by environmental degradation and the adverse effects of climate change.

There is no official contingency plan for managing large-scale population movements in times of emergencies. For example, there was no formal strategy in place for the influx of Haitian immigrants in 2012–2014, Angolans in 2016 or Venezuelans in 2017. These situations were managed ad hoc by the municipal government under the coordination of the SMDHC.

The main warning system in times of emergencies in the municipality of São Paulo is administered by the State government and not by the municipality.28 The communication system of the State of São Paulo’s Department for the Coordination of Civil Defense (Coordenadoria Estadual de Defesa Civil, CEDEC) does not take into account the specific

---

27 Decree 57533/2016 provides that the CRAI shall “assist the Municipal Public Administration in emergency situations caused by the possible arrival of large numbers of immigrants and refugees in situations of vulnerability.”

28 Regarding natural disasters, the city has plans set by the Municipal Department of Urban Security. More information is available at www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/city/sec- retariats/ubasecurity/civildfense/organization/index.php?p=247627. In the specific case of São Paulo, environmental risks are not linked to migration or displacement in large proportions.
vulnerabilities faced by immigrants. System warnings are restricted to mobile text messages, limiting communication to mobile phone owners, and the message is transmitted in Portuguese only.

Child and adolescent protection in general (non-immigrant specific) is provided by the SMADS through a variety of initiatives, including childcare, educational programmes and specialized telephone numbers to report child abuse. However, there are no specific procedures or measures for unaccompanied or abandoned immigrant children in times of crisis.

Capacity-building initiatives should be offered to all social assistance networks, and not only to practitioners working in immigrant-specific services.

The CAs could have specific socioeducational actions to combat xenophobia and discrimination between immigrant and non-immigrant populations.

The social assistance regulation does not foresee an immigrant-specific shelter as part of the social assistance network typification, meaning that they can more easily be remodeled for other purposes in case of need.
6.1. Migration governance: Examples of well-developed areas

Local guards are trained on issues related to the immigrant population, but on an ad hoc basis. The Coordinating Unit organizes training sessions for civil servants from all agencies and municipal government departments, including the Metropolitan Civil Guard (Guarda Civil Metropolitana). In 2014, 21 Guarda Civil Metropolitana officers received specific training to better attend to the immigrant population. Although no other specific courses for the Guarda Civil Metropolitana personnel took place, the Guarda Civil Metropolitana officers frequently participate in monthly training course “Somos Tod@s Migrantes”, offered by the Coordinating Unit in partnership with EMASP since 2017.

The municipality of São Paulo has experience in receiving vulnerable immigrants of many nationalities and has taken steps to facilitate their arrival through the creation of the CRAI, under the coordination of the Coordinating Unit. The CRAI receives immigrants and guides them through the public system to access benefits and services. In cases of migratory flows of an emergency nature, the city relied on emergency shelters, as occurred in the case of Haitian migration in 2014, Angolan in 2016 and Venezuelan in 2018 – although the emergency response was planned ad hoc. When the main volume of flows is found in other regions of the country, the municipality can negotiate and coordinate with the federal government to receive immigrant groups (as occurred with the Haitian migration in 2014 and the Venezuelan in 2018). In 2019, the CRAI mobile unit will be inaugurated and will provide itinerant services in different regions of the city.

The municipality of São Paulo has a cooperation agreement with the National Committee for Refugees (Comitê Nacional para os Refugiados, CONARE), which conducts refugee eligibility interviews at the SMDHC Center for Solidarity Economy.

The SMDHC is responsible for acting in cases of human rights violations in the municipality of São Paulo, including combating human trafficking and slave labour. In 2015, the SMDHC, together with the Public Prosecutor’s Office, launched the Anti-Human Trafficking Week, during which initiatives to raise awareness of the issue were implemented in support of the International Blue Heart Campaign. The Coordinating Unit also carried out other specific actions in the prevention of human trafficking, such as the promotion of a course for the Municipal Department of Health professionals on how to identify and deal with suspected trafficking and exploitation victims. This course took place in 2017 in partnership with IOM.

The Coordinating Unit, acting as executive secretary, appoints the president for the Municipal Commission for the Eradication of Slave Labour (Comissão Municipal para a Erradicação do Trabalho Escravo, COMTRAE), which is a joint collegial body that seeks to combat this form of exploitation, in accordance with the Municipal Plan for the Eradication of Slave Labour (Plano Municipal para Erradicação do Trabalho Escravo, PMETE). In 2019, COMTRAE is working on two priority projects, with support from the ILO: 1) monitoring of the PMETE; and 2) developing the Municipal Flow of Assistance to Victims Rescued from Slave Labour and Human Trafficking, which defines the SMDHC as the municipality’s focal point for victim follow-ups, through the Coordinating Unit. For cases related to rescued immigrants, the Coordinating Unit also has the support of the CRAI.

Regarding rescue operations of contemporary slave labour, the CRAI has provided support to the Regional Labour Superintendency of the Ministry of Economy in collecting complaints and assisting rescued immigrants.

---

29 The National Committee for Refugees (Comitê Nacional para os Refugiados, CONARE) is an interministerial body within the Ministry of Justice in Brasilia, responsible for examining asylum applications and declaring refugee status. It also has the function of guiding and coordinating the actions necessary for protection, as well as legal assistance and support.
The Federal Police, which operates at the International Airport of São Paulo in the municipality of Guarulhos, have constant and direct contact with the São Paulo’s municipal bodies to respond to immigrants’ needs and direct them to specific services.

6.2. Areas with potential for further development

There are no formal programmes or policies at the local level to attract former residents who emigrated from São Paulo or to facilitate their reintegration upon return. However, the municipal government has helped immigrants to return to their countries of origin with the support of IOM.

There could be more cooperation between the federal government and local governments in migration management and immigrant integration. Currently, the collaboration between the two levels of government is limited in that the municipality of São Paulo provides advice rather than actively participate in decisions. Such consultations may also involve a broader group of stakeholders.

Another potential area for further development is to extend the CRAI experience to other areas in the municipality.
Brazil, Government of

Brazil, Ministry of Justice and Public Safety

Brazil, Ministry of Labour

Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo

Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Municipal Department of Administration

Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Municipal Department of Economic Development

Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Municipal Department of Health
Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Municipal Department of Human Rights and Citizenship


2016a Mulheres Imigrantes e Refugiadas e a Luta por Políticas Públicas na Cidade de São Paulo. Available at www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/cidade/secretarias/direitos_humanos/migrantes/noticias/?p=156223.


Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Municipal Department of Social Assistance and Development


Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Office for Coordination of Policies for Immigrants and Promotion of Decent Work


Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Office of the Mayor

Brazil, Municipality of São Paulo, Regional Prefectures

Brazil, National Committee for Refugees

Brazil, Regional Electoral Tribunal of Rondônia

Brazil, Regional Prefectures

Brazil, State of São Paulo, Government Portal
2017 Já se cadastrou para receber SMS sobre riscos de desastre? Available at www.saopaulo.sp.gov.br/spnoticias/defesa-civil-ja-se-cadastro-para-receber-sms-sobre-riscos-de-desastre/.

Brazil, State of São Paulo, State Subdepartment of Civil Protection and Defense

Cabinet of the Mayor of São Paulo

Caixa Econômica Federal

Central Bank of Brazil

Franciscan Solidarity Service (Serviço Franciscano de Solidariedade, SEFRAS)

Institute of International Relations of the University of São Paulo
eBook%20Cosmopolis.pdf.

Legislative Assembly of the State of São Paulo

Metropolis

United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG)

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

United Nations in Brazil
2017 Prefeitura de SP apresenta políticas de inclusão e integração de migrantes e refugiados. Available at https://nacoesunidas.org/prefeitura-de-sp-apresenta-politicas-de-inclusao-e-integracao-de-migrantes-e-refugiados/.

United Nations Office for Disaster Risk Reduction
2014 Brazil’s São Paulo State recognized by UN for pioneering work in building urban resilience to disasters. Available at www.unisdr.org/archive/40966.
In an attempt to define the concept of “well-managed migration policies”, the International Organization for Migration (IOM) devised a Migration Governance Framework (MiGOF), which was welcomed by the IOM Council in November 2015. For the purposes of the Migration Governance Framework, IOM defines governance as “the traditions and institutions by which authority on migration, mobility and nationality in a country is exercised, including the capacity of the government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies in these areas”.

The Framework sets out the essential elements of “good migration governance” – 3 principles and 3 objectives which, if respected and fulfilled, would ensure that migration is humane, safe and orderly, and that it provides benefits for migrants and societies. IOM’s view is that a migration system promotes migration and human mobility that is humane and orderly and benefits migrants and society:

When it:
(i) Adheres to international standards and fulfils migrants’ rights;
(ii) Formulates policy using evidence and a “whole-of-government” approach;
(iii) Engages with partners to address migration and related issues;

As it seeks to:
(i) Advance the socioeconomic well-being of migrants and society;
(ii) Effectively address the mobility dimensions of crises;
(iii) Ensure that migration takes place in a safe, orderly and dignified manner.

The MiGOF does NOT create new standards or norms. In drafting the Framework, IOM relied on its expertise and analytical work, as well as on existing commitments, non-binding declarations and statements. It does NOT address global migration governance that is the international architecture for dealing with issues related to migration and human mobility. Instead, the focus is on the governance and management of migration from the point of view of the State as the primary actor. It does NOT propose one model for all States. The Framework presents a “high road” or ideal version of migration governance, to which States can aspire.

The MiGOF is based on the understanding that, as the primary actor in migration, mobility and nationality affairs, a State retains the sovereign right to determine who enters and stays in its territory and under what conditions, within the framework of international law. Other actors – citizens, migrants, international organizations, the private sector, unions, non-governmental organizations, community organizations, religious organizations and academia – contribute to migration governance through their interaction with States and each other.

The MGI process

1. **Launch of the Local MGI process**

   The first step of the process is to explain to key national and local government officials what the Local MGI entails, in order to ensure full understanding of the project and complete buy-in at both levels.

2. **Data collection**

   The second step of the process is to start the collection and analysis of data based on adapted indicators from the MGI. A draft local migration governance profile based on analysis of the findings is then shared with the government counterparts.

3. **Multi-stakeholder discussions on the results of the MGI**

   The third step of the process is to convene a consultation where local and national government officials and other stakeholders discuss the good practices and main gaps identified in the draft local migration governance profile. It is also an opportunity for them to comment on and provide suggestions to the draft profile.

4. **Final report**

   The last step is to finalize the local migration governance profile, obtain final validation from the local authorities, and publish a printed version of the report as well as an online version on the IOM Migration Data Portal and uploaded on IOM’s Online Bookstore.

---

12 You can find the profiles at [https://migrationdataportal.org/local-mgical-mgi](https://migrationdataportal.org/local-mgical-mgi).
13 Please see [https://publications.iom.int](https://publications.iom.int).
MIGRATION GOVERNANCE INDICATORS (MGI): CITY OF SÃO PAULO

www.migrationdataportal.org/mgi